



CORDELL BANK NATIONAL MARINE SANCTUARY SANCTUARY ADVISORY COUNCIL

MEETING MINUTES

February 20, 2014

9:45 AM – 2:45 PM

Point Reyes National Seashore, Red Barn Classroom, Point Reyes Station, CA

Note: The following meeting notes are an account of discussions at the meeting of the Sanctuary Advisory Council for Cordell Bank National Marine Sanctuary (CBNMS) and do not necessarily reflect the position of CBNMS and the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA).

Call to Order/Welcome/Roll Call (George Clyde)

Advisory Council Chair George Clyde called the meeting to order at 9:45 AM.

George welcomed everyone and asked Richard Ogg, the new primary Fishing member (who had been unable to attend the November meeting), to introduce himself. Richard said a few words, and was welcomed by all. Dan reiterated to advisory council members that their council role is to act as the liaison between the sanctuary and their respective sanctuary communities. Dan also noted people on the advisory council should respect and hear each other's opinions, even if when they do not agree.

George then called roll.

Members Present:

George Clyde (Chair, Community-at-Large - Marin)
Mike Cummings (Community-at-Large - Marin Alt.)
Bill Wolpert (Community-at-Large - Sonoma)
Sarah Hameed (Community-at-Large - Sonoma Alt.)
Todd Steiner (Conservation – Alt.)
Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook (Education)
Richard Ogg (Fishing)
Noah Wagner (Fishing Alt.)
Kevin Krick (Vice Chair, Maritime Activities)
Jaime Jahncke (Research)
Pete Adams (Research Alt.)
Brian Johnson (Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary [non-voting])
LT Cody Dunagan (United States Coast Guard [non-voting])

Members of the CBNMS staff were also present:

Dan Howard (Superintendent)
Michael Carver (Deputy Superintendent)
Lilli Ferguson (Resource Protection Specialist and advisory council coordinator)
Dani Lipski (Research Coordinator)
Jennifer Stock (Education and Outreach Coordinator)

Review and Approve Agenda (George Clyde)

The agenda was unanimously approved with one change; the speaker affiliation for Jarrod Santora was changed to University of California, Santa Cruz.

Review and Approve November Meeting Minutes (George Clyde)

The November 14, 2013 meeting minutes were reviewed. Bill Wolpert moved to approve them and Todd Steiner seconded the motion. All were in favor. *The November Sanctuary Advisory Council meeting minutes were accepted as final.*

Sanctuary Superintendent's Report (Dan Howard)

Proposed boundary expansion update: the proposed rule for boundary expansion of CBNMS and Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary (GFNMS) was reviewed by an attorney at the Office of National Marine Sanctuary (ONMS) headquarters in Silver Spring; next the draft environmental impact will be reviewed. Dan expressed hope of staying on schedule and said there would be a 60 day comment period with public meetings in the spring (a change in comment period length from before, to keep on schedule) and a May 1 joint advisory council meeting with GFNMS to discuss the proposal. He said the agency hoped to have its decision within two years of when the project was started – by December 2014.

CBNMS Fiscal Year 14 budget: Dan received budget the Friday before the meeting; it is enough to maintain current programs but funding will not support any new programs. Budget included some directed funding for three days of monitoring in the proposed expansion area.

Partner of the Year Award: Point Blue Conservation Science has been recognized as a partner of the year by ONMS; Point Blue had been jointly nominated by GFNMS and CBNMS for its offshore research monitoring program, and partnering with both sites on a number of other initiatives such as climate change, ship strikes of whales, oil spill response, etc.

In November, the second year of field sampling was completed at Cordell Bank, Farallon Islands and Deep Reef off of Half Moon Bay to evaluate the response of rockfish populations to Rockfish Conservation Area fishery closures. Goal of project is to investigate how fish populations have responded after 10 years of protection by comparing new catch data with historic data collected from 1987 thru 1998 (species composition, size, catch per unit effort). This two year project was funded by Collaborative Fisheries Research West and Rick Starr from California Sea Grant is the project lead; primary partners include National Marine Fisheries Service ([NMFS](#)) Santa Cruz, California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW), the [Fisheries & Conservation Biology Lab](#) at [Moss Landing Marine Laboratory](#), Charter boat captains in Half Moon Bay, Sausalito and Bodega and volunteer fishermen.

Jennifer Stock reported on the photo exhibit posted in the Red Barn classroom. She said they were drawn from photos collected over the last 14 years, and were a travelling exhibit featuring CBNMS. She mentioned where the exhibit had already been posted, where it was going in the future, and said suggestions from the advisory council for other locations for the exhibit with a lot of traffic would be appreciated. She likes to have an event to interact with people at each

venue, and was working to plan one for the Red Barn exhibit, to also coincide with the CBNMS 25th anniversary.

Office construction is moving along at Point Reyes. Based on the recent cost estimate of the office renovation, we are revisiting our idea to develop a shared ocean visitor space at the Point Reyes lighthouse. This will be a partnership among CBNMS, GFNMS, Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation, and the Point Reyes National Seashore. We will be kicking the effort off with a one day meeting with NOAA and Park staff to develop themes for the shared interpretive space. For our meeting, we will be using our west coast interpretive plan, and considering existing Park visitor center themes as well as ideas that are being developed for the GFNMS visitor center. The work will not start until the CBNMS offices are done, but the design package must be done by July.

Business Advisory Council (BAC): the new ONMS Business Advisory Council, to advise Dan Basta, had its first conference call in January, with 8 of 9 confirmed members attending. The agenda included a meet and greet, what they group could accomplish, and what they wanted to do. There is a web page for the BAC on the ONMS web site.

The San Francisco International Ocean Film Festival will be coming on March 5th and CBNMS will once again be sponsoring the student film competition. This year we had 42 student films submitted and we will be showing the top ten films and announcing the three winning films at the student film session on Sunday March 9th.

USCG District 11 training materials: Michael Carver has been working with USCG to update training material which will go into a curriculum at the new training center. Subject matter experts like Michael and GFNMS staff Karen Reyna and Max Delaney will be brought in on various topics, for example regarding sanctuary enforcement issues for boarding officers.

Advisory Council Business (Dan Howard and Lilli Ferguson)

Lilli described the currently open advisory council recruitment period and which seats would be open for application CBNMS is working to have the terms for primary seats and alternates start and end on a logical schedule so a few partial terms will be necessary. CBNMS would like to have about one third of the seats expire each year, and ideally to hold one recruitment per year.

Kevin Krick asked how officer terms would work. Lilli responded if he reapplied and was reappointed to his seat, he would continue to serve as Vice-Chair (the elections for Chair and Vice-Chair are held in April, with officer terms being two years).

Update on Applied California Current Ecosystem Studies (ACCESS) (Jaime Jachncke)

Jaime presented an update on the data gathered since 2004 and next steps for ACCESS.

Jaime reviewed ocean conditions and the variability over ten years, as well as how things like copepods, birds and krill respond to the conditions. A few highlights: small scale surface fronts (waters of different densities) are common, but don't last long enough to be important ecosystem drivers. Strong upwelling produces rich prey. Krill tend to congregate along the shelf break, with high density northeast of Cordell Bank. This is a hotspot for whales to feed. There is a

shipping lane that brings traffic right into this area – something to look at in the future as more data are gathered. The main seabird hotspots are north of Cordell Bank and the east of the Farallones archipelago. Jaime also mentioned efforts to monitor hypoxia, track ocean acidification, and to develop a whale monitoring network to try and reduce ship strikes of whales.

Public Comment

Tom Yarish said the California Coastal Commission (CCC) were getting updates on fracking policies, and recently received a staff presentation. He felt the CCC and staff were not fully aware of all the jurisdictions, issues, and consequences of fracking. He was concerned about the possibility of more development in this area. There have been reports to Congress and others about pollutants from fracking and he felt these pollutants could pose a threat if in the vicinity of a marine sanctuary. The federal government is issuing a number of permits in southern California. He wasn't sure if oil or gas or both were being sought. He concluded ocean currents could carry contaminants, and could show up in the food chain later.

Cordell Marine Sanctuary Foundation Update (Dan Howard)

Dan Howard reported for Tom Lambert, who had been unable to make the meeting due to a family health issue. The Foundation recently received a \$5,000 grant, to help promote the mission of the foundation. The Board decided to update their website, and a contractor has been hired. The Foundation has an ad in the ocean film festival brochure and also provided funding for some prize money for the student film competition. The Foundation is now able to accept gifts of securities.

Update on Sea Star Wasting (Dani Lipski)

Dani provided an overview of the sea star wasting disease, and noted more information could be found on the internet at pacificrockyintertidal.org. The disease tends to start as a white lesion on one arm, then spreads; parts of the sea star then tend to “melt” which leads to death; the progression is rapid. The cause is unknown but is thought to be a bacteria or virus; diseased sea stars were first seen in the Pacific Northwest a year ago; it was in Bodega Bay by the spring, then in southern California in the summer. There is a large, well-coordinated effort to monitor the disease—long term data sets from several studies are contributing to the knowledge base. Kaitlin Graiff, CBNMS Research Specialist, examined the images taken by the BAUI divers in October 2013, and did not see any evidence of sea stars on the Bank being affected by the syndrome, but the amount of data represented a limited slice of time and locations. Dani concluded she would love to hear from people what they see when viewing sea stars at their favorite beaches and tidepools.

Presentation: Spatio-temporal Dynamics of Ocean Conditions, Krill, Forage Fish, and Top Predators off Northern-central California: Combining Observations and Models (Jarrod Santora, University of California, Santa Cruz)

Jarrod works for U.C. Santa Cruz, starting a research associate position there last year; he also has an office at NOAA. He does work both on California integrated ecosystem assessments and on some similar work in the Antarctic. He puts together a variety of oceanographic data then looks at things like predator response, krill hotspots, seascapes, baseline spatial ecology, etc.

Members' and Alternates' Reports (Sanctuary Advisory Council)

Leslie Adler-Ivanbrook: She described education efforts with the Golden Gate National Recreation Area, working in the Giacomini Wetlands and a 24-hour citizen science/school group assessment of species. Coming up, there will be a day for citizens to gather and learn at a festival at Crissy Field. She relayed for Rachel Bergren, the Education seat alternate, that a new Marine Mammal Center facility is under construction, in Kona, Hawaii, and said there was a new education program at the Marine Mammal Center in Sausalito, including an overnight program called Seals and Slippers. Rachel also has highlights of the rescue season.

Todd: He discussed coho spawning season, noting 350 fish were counted in the Lagunitas Creek watershed, with the last storm event doubling the number of fish seen up to that point. This is later in the year than they have ever been seen before. To recover the species in the Lagunitas Creek watershed, they would need 2600 fish, so current numbers are only about 13% of historic runs. Lots of steelhead were also seen following the last storm

Brian, reporting out for GFNMS: The invasive species rule should be published in the Federal Register February 20 or 21, available for public comment, he reported. The white shark assessment in the Farallones is planned to be released in the next few weeks. The Mavericks surf contest took place on January 24, for which there was a U.S. Coast Guard permit (USCG), and wildlife observers. One potential incident during the contest is being investigated. Regarding the Tomales Bay mooring process, there will be a 90 day period coming up for current mooring holders to apply for a California State Lands permit. For events, GFNMS is promoting the San Francisco International Ocean Film Festival and the topic at the next soiree (one of a series of parties at which a speaker talks) is mola mola.

LT Dunagan: He said there had been a sanctuary violation in GFNMS. The May 1 SAC meeting will be his last; he is heading to North Carolina and will be going back to sea. LCDR Joe Giammanco will then take over the USCG's primary representative to the advisory council for the next four years.

Kevin: A California air regulation went into effect on January 1, 2014; 50% of ships in California ports are now plugging into shore power; the percentage will go up in the coming years. While it probably won't make too much difference here, likely a dramatic difference will be seen in Los Angeles/Long Beach. The Marine Environmental Protection Committee for the International Maritime Organization (IMO) will meet the first week of April; at the last meeting, the Russian delegation proposed delaying NOx emission standards, but the U.S. says the technology is there to implement it. If there is a delay, the California Air Resources Board may consider more stringent requirements. The IMO's ballast water convention, which regards treatment systems on board ships for controlling introduction of invasive species, is almost ratified; this will be discussed at the IMO's next meeting, especially protocols for testing. There have been several drafts of a rule on hull fouling from the California State Lands Commission, but nothing has come out in a while, and the USCG has a more stringent recommendation. Kevin commented the technology wasn't there yet, and the technology to use would depend on the conditions found along the vessel's trade route.

Jaime: At the GFNMS SAC meeting, the USFWS discussed the method that might be used to eradicate mice on the Farallon Islands; a final EIS is expected this summer. If the project is finalized, likely the first eradication effort would be fall 2015. Regarding Cassin's auklets, the surveys are a month earlier than usual this year due to the breeding efforts being earlier. He also reported the Marine Life Protection Act monitoring sites were selected, and work will be done on how to do long term monitoring, to see the effects of the marine protected areas over time.

Sarah Hameed: Surfrider's Sonoma County chapter was focused on pushing bans of single use plastic bags statewide – a ban passed in Sonoma County. They were also still fighting the “iron rangers” for local state parks; this will be discussed by the CCC in May. Researchers are looking for evidence of radiation (traces of radionuclides) from Fukushima in kelp up and down the coast. Bodega Marine Laboratory (BML) has been working with students, with funding from the National Science Foundation; this year the science conference begins April 30; it is the last year as funding is ending. Also, a new undergraduate program in Marine and Coastal Science has been approved at UC Davis. Finally, she checked into the possibility of holding a SAC meeting at BML in the future; there would be a cost for the advisory council to use the room.

Bill: Last month Sonoma County worked on a climate action 20/20 plan, with the aim to reduce carbon level; brainstorming about what everyone can do to make a difference was a focus, he noted. The next meeting of that group is in April. He is concerned about the built environment, including when plans, zoning ordinances, and building regulations are updated. He feels the process for the built environment is currently not flexible enough to adapt and change as we see impacts of climate change, including from excess greenhouse gases in the atmosphere.

George: There was an algae bloom in southern Tomales Bay in November; normally algae blooms happen in summer and closer to the mouth. The algae bloom in November was composed of dinoflagellates that cause paralytic shellfish poisoning, and the bloom spread to the entire bay, shutting down all the shellfish beds right around a critical sales time before it dissipated.

In closing, George noted there are tentative plans for a future presentation to the advisory council on submarine canyons. The next council meeting is May 1.

George adjourned the meeting at 2:43 PM.